

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) 2023/24 Report Hull University Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust

1. Background

This report details the Trust's 2023/24 Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) technical data, and key findings from this data. An Action Plan, designed to address the gaps in workplace experience between White and BAME staff, is attached as Appendix 2.

This report and Action Plan must be published on the Trust's external website by 31 October 2023.

2. Introduction

The Trust employed 10,051 staff at 31 March 2024. This is an increase of 546 staff in total compared to the previous reporting period (9,505 staff as at 31 March 2023).

The number and percentage of staff by ethnicity is as follows:

Ethnicity	31 March 2023	31 March 2024
White	7541 (79.34%)	7740 (77.01%)
BAME	1777 (18.70%) (+219)	2112 (21.01%) (+335)
Not Stated	187 (1.96%)	199 (1.98%)
Grand Total	9,505	10,051

NB: The number colour coded in brackets shows where the change is **positive/negative** for BAME colleagues

2 WRES 2023/24 Data

3.1 Indicator 1: Percentage of staff in each of the AfC Bands 1-9 OR Medical and Dental subgroups and Very Senior Managers (including Executive Board members) compared with the percentage of staff in the overall workforce Non-Clinical Staff

In the non-clinical category, there has been a total increase of 485 staff across all ethnicities (from 2278 to 2763). Of this there has been an increase of BAME staff by 35 (from 103 to 138).

Table 1: The number and percentage of **NON-CLINICAL** staff at 31 March 2023

	White		BAME		Unknown	
	Headcount	%	Headcount	%	Headcount	%
Under B1	10	90.91	0	0.00	1	9.09
B1	16	94.12	1	5.88	0	0.00
B2	1106	92.32	77	6.43	15	1.25
B3	599	95.23	28	4.45	2	0.32
B4	271	96.79	7	2.50	2	0.71
B5	184	95.34	9	4.66	0	0.00
B6	136	97.14	4	2.86	0	0.00
B7	103	91.16	5	4.42	5	4.42
B8a	65	94.20	3	4.35	1	1.45
B8b	44	93.61	2	4.26	1	2.13
B8c	19	100.00	0	4.17	0	0.00
B8d	11	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
B9	4	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
VSM	29	90.63	2	6.25	1	3.12
Total	2597		138		28	

Clinical Non-Medical Staff

In the clinical non-medical category, there has been a total increase of 215 staff across all ethnicities (from 5628 to 5843). Which includes there has been an increase of BAME staff by 164 (from 731 to 895).

The most significant contributor to the increase in BAME staff headcount is due to the Trust's continued sourcing of internationally educated nurses who will account for the majority of the increase in Band 5 BAME nurses.

Table 2: The number/percentage of **CLINICAL NON-MEDICAL** staff at 31 March 2024

	White		BAME		Unknown	
	Headcount	%	Headcount	%	Headcount	%
Under B1	61	95.31	3	4.69	0	0.00
B1	1	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
B2	1061	92.99	69	6.05	11	0.96
B3	487	95.49	17	3.33	6	1.18
B4	209	96.31	7	3.23	1	0.46
B5	1287	66.27	621	31.98	34	1.75
B6	911	87.85	115	11.09	11	1.06
B7	605	92.79	41	6.29	6	0.92
B8a	163	88.81	19	10.27	3	1.62
B8b	51	98.08	1	1.92	0	0.00
B8c	20	95.24	1	4.76	0	0.00
B8d	3	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
B9	2	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
VSM	14	87.50	1	6.25	1	6.25
Total	4875		895		73	

Medical and Dental Staff

There has been a total increase of medical and dental staff across all ethnicities by 88 (from 1304 to 1392) included in this is an increase of BAME staff by 31 (from 751 to 782).

Table 3: The number/percentage of **MEDICAL AND DENTAL** staff at 31 March 2024

	White		BAME		Unknown	
	Headcount	%	Headcount	%	Headcount	%
Consultants	234	44.73	271	52.34	15	2.93
Non-Consultant Career Grade	14	22.58	46	74.19	2	3.23
Trainee Grades	273	33.70	465	57.41	72	8.89
Other	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Total	521		782		89	

Table 4: The number and percentage of **NON-CLINICAL** staff in each band over 2 years

	2022/23		2023/24		2022/23		2023/24		2022/23		2023/24	
	White Headcount	White %	White Headcount	White %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %
Under B1	8	100.00	8	90.91	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	1	9.09
B1	17	94.44	17	94.12	1	5.56	1	5.88	0	0.00	0	0.00
B2	911	92.96	911	92.32	58	5.92	77	6.43	11	1.12	15	1.25
B3	464	95.67	464	95.23	18	3.71	28	4.45	3	0.62	2	0.32
B4	207	96.28	207	96.79	6	2.79	7	2.50	2	0.93	2	0.71
B5	159	95.78	159	95.34	7	4.22	9	4.66	0	0.00	0	0.00
B6	130	97.74	130	97.14	3	2.26	4	2.86	0	0.00	0	0.00
B7	89	90.82	89	91.15	4	4.08	5	4.42	5	5.10	5	4.42
B8a	65	94.20	65	94.20	2	2.90	3	4.35	2	2.90	1	1.45
B8b	44	93.62	44	93.62	2	4.26	2	4.26	1	2.13	1	2.13
B8c	19	100.00	19	100.00	0	4.17	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
B8d	8	88.89	8	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	1	11.11	0	0.00
B9	4	100.00	4	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
VSM	25	92.59	25	90.63	2	7.41	2	6.25	0	0.00	1	3.13
Total	2150		2597		103		138		25		28	

Table 5: The number and percentage of **CLINICAL NON-MEDICAL** staff in each band over 2 years

	2022/23		2023/24		2022/23		2023/24		2022/23		2023/24	
	White Headcount	White %	White Headcount	White %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %
Under B1	61	95.31	66	92.96	3	4.69	5	7.04	0	0.00	0	0.00
B1	1	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
B2	1061	92.99	860	89.49	69	6.05	86	8.95	11	0.96	15	1.56
B3	487	95.49	423	92.36	17	3.33	30	6.55	6	1.18	5	1.09
B4	209	96.31	160	95.24	7	3.23	8	4.76	1	0.46	0	0.00
B5	1287	66.27	1318	62.14	621	31.98	781	36.82	34	1.75	22	1.04
B6	911	87.85	945	88.07	115	11.09	118	11.00	11	1.06	10	0.93
B7	605	92.79	619	92.66	41	6.29	42	6.29	6	0.92	7	1.05
B8a	163	88.81	175	88.38	19	10.27	20	10.10	3	1.62	3	1.52
B8b	51	98.08	56	98.25	1	1.92	1	1.75	0	0.00	0	0.00

Final 29/10/24

B8c	20	95.24	18	94.74	1	4.76	1	5.26	0	0.00	0	0.00
B8d	3	100.00	4	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.0
B9	2	100.00	2	100.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
VSM	14	87.50	8	100.00	1	6.25	0	0.00	1	6.25	0	0.00
Total	4875		4654		895		1092		73		62	

Table 6: The number and percentage of **MEDICAL AND DENTAL** staff in each band over 2 years

	2022/23		2023/24		2022/23		2023/24		2021/22		2023/24	
	White Headcount	White %	White Headcount	White %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	BAME Headcount	BAME %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %	Unknown Headcount	Unknown %
Consultants	234	44.73	247	44.50	271	52.34	289	52.07	15	2.93	19	9.23
Non-Consultant Career Grade	14	22.58	13	20.00	46	74.19	46	70.77	2	3.23	6	3.23
Trainee Grades	273	33.70	236	27.16	465	57.41	549	63.18	72	8.89	84	9.67
Other	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Total	521		496		782		884		89		109	

3.2 Indicator 2: Relative likelihood of staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts

In comparison to the 2022/23 WRES data, this year's data shows:

- 1926 BAME applicants were shortlisted and 409 appointed compared to last year (which showed 1606 BAME applicants were shortlisted and 322 appointed).
- The percentage of BAME staff being appointed from shortlisting has improved. This reflects through in the slight improvement in the relative likelihood of appointment. The relative likelihood is that White staff are 1.19 times more likely to be appointed from shortlisting compared to BAME colleagues.

Table 7: The percentage of staff **SHORTLISTED** and **APPOINTED** over 2 years

Ethnicity	2022/23	2023/24
White	26.00%	25.17%
BAME	20.05%	21.24%
Not Stated	31.67%	58.06%
Relative likelihood	1.30	1.19

NB: Colour coded to show where the change is **positive/negative** for BAME colleagues

3.3 Indicator 3: Relative likelihood of staff entering the formal disciplinary process, as measured by entry into a formal disciplinary investigation

This indicator takes into account staff who have been through the formal disciplinary process by ethnicity.

In comparison to the 2022/23 WRES data, the 2023/24 data shows:

- BAME staff are now again less likely to enter into the disciplinary process than White staff.
- The number of disciplinaries in total across all ethnicities from 1 April 2023 to 31 March 2024 has increased by 53 (from 76 to 129).
- The number of BAME staff entering the formal disciplinary process has increased by 8 (from 15 to 23 in total over the last year).

Table 8: Percentage of staff who entered into a **FORMAL DISCIPLINARY PROCESS**

Ethnicity	2022/23	2023/24
White	0.80%	1.33%
BAME	0.84%	1.03%
Not Stated	0.53%	1.51%
Relative likelihood	1.06	0.82

NB: Colour coded to show where the change is **positive/negative** for BAME colleagues

3.4 Indicator 4: Relative likelihood of staff accessing non-mandatory training and CPD

In comparison to the 2022/23 WRES data, this year's data shows:

- The number of BAME staff accessing training has increased marginally by 74 employees (from 1361 to 1435).
- Within the Trust, the relative likelihood shows that BAME staff are more likely to access non-mandatory training and CPD than White staff, though in effect there is equality of access.

Table 9: Percentage of staff who accessed **NON-MANDATORY TRAINING** and **CPD**

Ethnicity	2022/23	2023/24
White	74.69%	65.22%
BAME	76.59%	67.95%
Not Stated	74.33%	61.81%
Relative likelihood	0.98	0.96

NB: Colour coded to show where the change is **positive**/**negative** for BAME colleagues

3.5 Indicator 5-8 Staff Survey Results

The 2023/24 Staff Survey results show in comparison to the 2022/23 data:

- Bullying & Harassment by patients and service users towards BAME staff and White staff has fallen significantly.
- Bullying and harassment from staff has increased for White staff but decreased for BAME staff.
- The number of staff who feel that the Trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion has increased by 16% for BAME staff, whilst increasing by a lesser amount for White staff.
- The number of BAME staff who stated that they personally experienced discrimination at work from a manager/team leader or other colleagues has increased by nearly 8%.

Table 10: Data for Indicators 5 to 8

Staff Survey Indicators	White %		BAME %	
	2022/23	2023/24	2022/23	2023/24
Indicator 5: KF25. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months	28.8%	24.9%	33.0%	30.4%
Indicator 6: KF26. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months	21.5%	22.6%	31.3%	28.5%
Indicator 7: KF21. Percentage believing that the Trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion	58.1%	61.5%	46.6%	54.1%
Indicator 8: Q17. In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work from a manager/team leader or other colleagues	6.6%	5.9%	16.4%	17.7%

NB: Colour coded to show where the change is **positive**/**negative** for BAME colleagues

3.6 Indicator 9: Percentage difference between (i) the organisations' Board voting membership and its overall workforce and (ii) the organisations' Board executive membership and its overall workforce

As at 31 March 2024, the Trust has 18 Board members in total, of which:

- 16 (88.9%) are of White ethnicity compared to 15 in the previous year.
- 2 (11.1%) are BAME staff members which is the same as the previous year.

Table 11: Percentage difference between the **BOARD MEMBERSHIP VS. OVERALL WORKFORCE**

Ethnicity	2022/23	2023/24
Difference (total Board – overall workforce)	-6.9%	-10.0%

4 Achievements throughout 2023/24

There have been a number of achievements in the past year, which are detailed below:

4.1 Zero Tolerance to Racism

Zero Tolerance to Racism reporting tool & launched August 2022 consolidated through the year and became a core part of the workload of the EDI manager.

The Circle group that was established meeting on a fortnightly basis, has been able to offer support to BAME staff who raise issues and ensure that outcomes are delivered to the impacted staff.

4.2 Career Enrichment Programme

This has now been established with 6 people being provided with career mentoring from a qualified group of mentors who will work with them on an individual basis wasn't believed that the shadow board concept would be a practical solution to the issue of BAME representation in the Trust, instead an alternative programme is being developed in conjunction with the BAME staff network that will offer BAME staff opportunities at career enhancement, involving a blend of development, secondments and mentoring.

4.3 BAME Conference

Another successful conference was held at the Mercure in December the keynote speaker was Louie Horne a Filipino Nurse from NHS England who talked about the journey of an international nurse and expressed her surprise at the Trusts lack of International Nurses at management level.

4.4 BAME Staff Network

To support Yoghini Nagandran as Chair. Andrew Mooraby, Jay Choudhury & Michio Abe were appointed as joint deputies. The focus has been to increase the number of members and also the engagement with the network.

4.5 Withstand Leadership Programme

The Trust in in association with BRAP, ran a successful leadership programme with engagement with over 30 staff members. We will now track the careers of the participants to assess the success of the programme.

5 Summary

Improvements have been made across the following indicators:

- The total number of BAME staff has increased across the staff groups by 335 (from 1777 to 2112) which is a positive, however further work to provide career progression opportunities, to BAME colleagues (in line with the national WRES Model Employer goals) needs to continue.
- BAME staff are now slightly less likely to enter into the formal disciplinary process compared to White staff.
- BAME staff are marginally more likely to access non-mandatory training and CPD compared to White staff.

Further improvements need to be made across the following indicators:

- Although the percentage of BAME staff being appointed from shortlisting increased in the last 12 months, the relative likelihood of White staff being appointed from shortlisting compared to BAME staff only decreased slightly.
- Whilst there have been improvements in lived experiences further work to improve the experiences of BAME staff in relation to bullying and harassment and career progression/promotion needs to continue.
- There needs to be initiatives to improve the diversity of the Trust Board.

The Trust continues to be committed to closing the gap between White and BAME work life experience and will have a detailed Action Plan for 2024/25.

WRES Indicators

1. Indicator 1 - compare the data for white and BAME staff: Percentage of staff in each of the AfC Bands 1-9 and VSM (including executive Board members) compared with the percentage of staff in the overall workforce
2. Relative likelihood of staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts
3. Relative likelihood of staff entering the formal disciplinary process, as measured by entry into a formal disciplinary investigation
4. Relative likelihood of staff accessing non-mandatory training and CPD
5. KF: 25. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months
6. KF 26. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months
7. KF 21. Percentage believing that trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion
8. Q17. In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work from a manager/team leader or other colleagues
9. Percentage difference between (i) the organisations' Board voting membership and its overall workforce and (ii) the organisations' Board executive membership and its overall workforce

Appendix 2 - Workforce Race Equality Standard Action Plan 2024/25

The Action Plan 2024/25 has been developed, based on the 2023/2 WRES technical data results, to help close the gaps in workplace experience between White and Black and Ethnic Minority (BAME) staff. A separate detailed workplan supports the Action Plan.

Action	WRES Indicator	Timescale	Lead
Embed the Zero Tolerance to Racism Framework and Reporting tool across the Group and into the care groups to encourage reporting	Indicators 5, 6, 8	Ongoing	EDI Manager
Establish a quarterly communication board meeting for BAME network members to meet with Trust Executives and Non-Executives to bring issues to the attention of the board and also understand how Trust board decisions are come to and what considerations are given to race in those decisions.	Indicators 1, 8, 9	January 25/Ongoing	Workforce & OD EDI Team
Continue the project group working on improving the appraisal process to consider ways that specific inclusion objectives can be incorporated into the appraisal process as a Group appraisal process is adopted	Indicators 6, 7, 8	December 24/Ongoing	EDI Manager & OD Team
A new Group wide project group will be established reviewing recruitment processes through the lens of EDI. Key things to introduce: Allow people for whom English is a second language to request 20% additional time to process and translate. Introduce a survey for all applicants to be able to feedback the inclusivity of the process this will enable the Group to identify hotspots of good and not so good practice and introduce corrective interventions. Ensure that all recruitment panels have a dedicated EDI champion	Indicators 1, 2, 7	March 25/Ongoing	EDI Manager
Enable the supernumerary Inductions to the Trust that International Nurses get via OSCE, to be in some way replicated for all staff groups in	Indicator 1, 4,	February 25/Ongoing	OD & EDI Manager

particular AHP's who are in the numbers from day 1			
Expand our internally designed Career Enhancing Programme that will be designed to expedite career opportunities for BAME staff beyond the existing Mentoring to Development & Secondments	Indicator 1, 9	January 25/Ongoing	OD Team
Enhance our offer of support for international medical graduates who join the Trust as resident doctors to include proactive support in finding accommodation and all of the ancillaries that go with relocating internationally.	Indicator 1, 3, 7		Medical Education Team
Consider making the national programme Introducing Cultural Intelligence programmes for nursing managers of Internationally Educated Nurses mandatory for all nursing managers and expand across other professional groups	Indicator 6	March 25/Ongoing	EDI Manager & Nursing Director/Medical Director
Continue the Withstand Development Programme to bolster our offer to Band 4-6 Clinical BAME staff It is an innovative programme designed to bridge the gap between where participants are and where they would like their future career to be. It has been well received and attended.	Indicator 1, 7	February 25	OD Team
Extend the Probation period for all non NHS educated international staff, to factor in the additional training needed, adjust the process to make it less formal and more supportive	Indicator 1, 8	December 25	Human Resources Advisory Team